Karnataka Lokayukta

(Under Section 7 of the Karnataka Lokayukta Act, 1984)

CASE NUMBER: COMPT/LOK/BD /1346/2019

District:

Chikkaballapur

BY:

1. SUO MOTO,

As per the order of Honble Lokayukta Dated:26/04/2019

Mobile/Landline:

COMPLAINANT/S

AGAINST:

1. PRINCIPAL SECRETARY TO GOVERNMENT,

Primary and Secondary Education Department, M.S. Building, BENGALURU.

2. COMMISSIONER,

Public Instruction Department, N.T. Road. BENGALURU.

3. DEPUTY DIRECTOR,

Public Instruction Department, CHIKKABALLAPURA District.

RESPONDENT/S

Allegation/Grievance Dereliction of Duty.

Received From:

By Lok//Bcd/2349/2018/ARE-1

Received On:

16-05-2019

Seal and Signature

Complaint stands

allotted to:

ARE-1

SCRUTINY AND OPINION

KARNATAKA LOKAYUKTA, BENGALURU

No.Compt/LOK/BD-1346/2019/ARE-1 Date: 07.12.2019

ORDER

This is a suo-motu proceedings initiated in terms of the Orders dated 11.1.2019 and 26.4.2019 made in Complaint No.LOK/BCD-2349/2018. In the order dated 11.1.2019 at para-6, I had observed as follows –

- " since, it has come to my notice with regard to the bad condition of the buildings of the schools located in other parts of the state, I am of the view, it would be in the interest of justice to direct the respondent No.1 and 2 to submit the status report on the following-
- The conditions of all school buildings coming under the primary and secondary education, with reference to each district and taluks.
- (2) The respondent no.2 may obtain such reports from the respective deputy directors of public instructions who shall in turn secure the report from the Block education officer and head masters of the concerned schools.

- (3) The particulars of the schools where immediate steps are required to be taken for repair and reconstruction of the buildings".
- 2) Pursuant to my order, comments were called from the concerned authorities. It is useful to extract the note dated 5.12.2019 submitted by the Additional Registrar of Enquirieis-1, Karnataka Lokayukta, Bengaluru, which reads as follows –

"This is a suo-moto complaint registered in respect of the bad condition of the school buildings, which comes under Primary and Secondary Education Department situated in different parts of the state. By order dated 20-05-2019 Hon'ble Lokayukta directed the Deputy Director of Public Instructions, Bengaluru Urban District to submit list of all the schools situated in that district, which requires urgent repairs/reconstruction after securing information from the concerned BEO's.

Now report is received from the Deputy Director of Public Instructions. The Deputy Director of Public instructions has listed the schools in which buildings are in dilapidated condition requiring urgent repairs/reconstruction.



Therefore if approved the copy of the report will be forwarded to the Principal Secretary to Government, department of Public Instructions, Bengaluru to take immediate action for repairs/reconstruction of the school buildings listed in the report, which requires urgent attention as the safety of the students studying in those schools is involved. The case may be listed on **05-02-2020.**"

Along with the report dated 19.07.2019 submitted by the Deputy Director (Admn.), Public Instructions Department, Chikkaballapura District, the details of the schools which require immediate repair has been set out. The Schools referred to in the report are all Government Schools. It is needless to point out while the State has the duty and obligation to provide education to the students, it is implied that there is an obligation to create a congenial atmosphere for imparting education in the Educational Institutions. It is also needless to point out the condition of the buildings should be suitable for imparting education with all the facilities provided. The dilapidated condition of the building, if it remains unattended, and make it suitable for imparting education to the

students, it would result in serious consequences to the life and liberty of the students who attend the school, violating the rights guaranteed under Article 21 and 21A of Constitution of India, and Right of Children to free and compulsory Education Act -2009. In this connection it is useful to refer to the observations made by the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India, in the case of Avinash Mehrotra Vs. Union of India and others reported in (2009) 6 SCC 398 which reads as hereunder —

- **"24.** Education occupies an important place in our Constitution and culture. There has been emphasis on free and compulsory education for children in this country for a long time. There is a very strong historical perspective. The Hunter Commission in 1882-1883, almost 125 years ago, recommended universal education in India. It proposed to make education compulsory for the children.
- **25.** The Government of India Act, 1935 provided that "education should be made free and compulsory for both boys and girls". While debating on a Bill in the Imperial Legislation Council in 1911, Shri Gopal Krishna Gokhale strongly advocated that elementary education should be both compulsory and free.
- **26.** Our original Framers of the Constitution placed free and compulsory education in the directive principles. The unamended Article 45 provided that:
 - "45. Provision for free and compulsory education for children.—The State shall endeavour to provide, within a period of ten years from the commencement of this Constitution, for free and compulsory education for all children until they complete the age of fourteen years."

Mu

- 27. The Kothari Commission on Education set up by the Government of India in 1966 strongly recommended free and compulsory education for children up to 14 years. The Commission observed that there is no other way for the poor to climb their way out of this predicament.
- **28.** Education occupies a sacred place within our Constitution and culture. Article 21-A of the Constitution, adopted in 2002, codified this Court's holding in *Unni Krishnan*, *J.P.* v. *State of A.P.* [(1993) 1 SCC 645] in which we established a right to education. Parliament did not merely affirm that right; the amending Act placed the right to education within the Constitution's set of fundamental rights, the most cherished principles of our society. As the Court observed in *Unni Krishnan*¹: (SCC p. 664, para 8)

"8. The immortal poet Valluvar whose *Tirukkural* will surpass all ages and transcend all religions said of education:

'Learning is excellence of wealth that none destroy; To man nought else affords reality of joy.' "

- **29.** Education today remains liberation—a tool for the betterment of our civil institutions, the protection of our civil liberties, and the path to an informed and questioning citizenry. Then as now, we recognise education's "transcendental importance" in the lives of individuals and in the very survival of our Constitution and Republic.
- **30.** In the years since the inclusion of Article 21-A, we have clarified that the right to education attaches to the individual as an inalienable human right. We have traced the broad scope of this right in R.D. Upadhyay v. State of A.P. [(2007) 15 SCC 337: AIR 2006 SC 1946] holding that the **State must provide education to all children in all places, even in prisons, to the children of prisoners. We have also affirmed the inviolability of the right to education.**
- 35. The Constitution likewise provides meaning to the word "education" beyond its dictionary meaning. Parents should not be compelled to send their children to dangerous schools, nor should children suffer compulsory education in unsound buildings.

- 36. Likewise, the State's reciprocal duty to parents begins with the provision of a free education, and it extends to the State's regulatory power. No matter where a family seeks to educate its children, the State must ensure that children suffer no harm in exercising their fundamental right and civic duty. States thus bear the additional burden of regulation, ensuring that schools provide safe facilities as part of a compulsory education.
- 37. In the instant case, we have no need to sketch all the contours of the Constitution's guarantees, so we do not. We merely hold that the right to education incorporates the provision of safe schools.
- 39. In view of the importance of Article 21-A, it is imperative that the education which is provided to children in the primary schools should be in the environment of safety.
- 45. In the end, we should need to do little but enforce existing laws and encourage States in their own well-intentioned safety programmes. However, in the years since the fire at Lord Krishna Middle School, some States have moved slowly and safety standards have varied in quality across the States. These delays and variations have subjected millions more school children to danger from fire, earthquakes and other causes, when simple enhancements could offer much greater protection. Articles 21 and 21-A of the Constitution require that India's school children receive education in safe schools. In order to give effect to the provisions of the Constitution, we must ensure that India's schools adhere to basic safety standards without further delay.
- 46. It is the fundamental right of each and every child to receive education free from fear of security and safety. The children cannot be compelled to receive education from an unsound and unsafe building.
- 47. In view of what happened in Lord Krishna Middle School in District Kumbakonam where 93 children were burnt alive and several similar incidences had happened in the past, therefore, it has become imperative to direct that safety measures as prescribed by the National Building Code of India,



2005 be implemented by all government and private schools functioning in our country. We direct that:

- (i) Before granting recognition or affiliation, the State Governments and Union Territories concerned are directed to ensure that the buildings are safe and secure from every angle and they are constructed according to the safety norms incorporated in the National Building Code of India.
- (ii) All existing government and private schools shall install fire extinguishing equipments within a period of six months.
- (iii) The school buildings be kept free from inflammable and toxic material. If storage is inevitable, they should be stored safely.
- (iv) Evaluation of structural aspect of the school may be carried out periodically. We direct that the engineers and officials concerned must strictly follow the National Building Code. The safety certificate be issued only after proper inspection. Dereliction in duty must attract immediate disciplinary action against the officials concerned.
- (v) Necessary training be imparted to the staff and other officials of the school to use the fire extinguishing equipments.
- **48.** The Education Secretaries of each State and the Union Territories are directed to file an affidavit of compliance with this order within one month after installation of fire extinguishing equipments."
- 4) In the light of what is stated above, it is the duty of the officer incharge of educational institutions both Government and private to monitor regularly the conditions of the building with regard to the suitability of the building and take immediate

remedial measures to carry out the repairs etc., if it is the Government educational institution and if it is private/aided education institution to give appropriate directions to the concerned who are running/managing such educational institutions to take immediate appropriate remedial steps to make the building suitable for use and to avoid any untoward ward Staff of the schooly incident to the students, Failure to take remedial measures in my considered view, has to be considered administration on the part of the authorities of the State within the meaning of Section 2(10) of the Karnataka Lokayukta Act. The list enclosed would disclose that several buildings, as referred in the list, are in a very bad condition and is likely to cause serious injury to the life and liberty of the students and to the teachers who are attending the school and therefore they call for immediate repair and remedial measures.

5) Hence, I am of the view, it would be in the interest of justice to make an order in exercise of the powers conferred on me under Section 12(1) of the Karnataka Lokayukta Act, to direct the respondents to examine the list submitted by the

M

Deputy Director (Administration), Public Instructions
Department, Chikkaballapura District and take steps to carry
out repairs to the school buildings located at Chikkaballapura
District, without further delay and at any event not later than
six months from the date of receipt of this order.

6) Further, the respondents are directed to file the interim Status Report with regard to the steps taken by the authorities to carry out the direction given above within three months from the date of receipt of this order.

Communicate this order to the parties concerned. List this case on 5th February, 2020.

stice P. Vishwanatha Shetty)

Lokayukta State of Karnataka

*vl

Additional Registrar of Enq.1

 स्थान के स्थान में किए के स्थान के स्थ

In this case Hon'ble Lokayukta has issued certain directions to the authorities to take urgent steps to carry out repairs to the school buildings which are in dilapidated condition in the State within a period of six months from the date of receipt of the order.

Copy of letter dated 02.01.2020 sent by the Commissioner, Department of Public Instructions to the Deputy Director of Public instructions and B.E.Os of all the District in the State to take up repair and development works in the schools situated in their District is received in No.Compt/LOK/BGM-1341/2019.

Details of the schools, which require urgent repairs is called from the D.D.P.Is of some of the Districts but not yet received. Therefore, put up the case on 15.04.2020.

13.05.2020

 †) ಕರೋನ ವೈರಸ್ನ ಪಿಡುಗಿನಿಂದ ಲಾಕ್ಡೌನ್ ಘೋಷಣೆ ಮಾಡಿದ್ದರಿಂದ ಪ್ರಕರಣವನ್ನು ಆದೇಶಕ್ಕೆ ನಿಗಧಿತ ದಿನಾಂಕದಂದು ಮಂಡಿಸಲಾಗಿಲ್ಲ. ಮಾನ್ಯರ ಮುಂದಿನ ಆದೇಶಕ್ಕಾಗಿ ಕಡತವನ್ನು ಮಂಡಿಸಿದೆ.

ಮುಂದಿನ ಕ್ರಮಕ್ಕಾಗಿ ಪ್ರಕರಣವನ್ನು ದಿನಾಂಕ: 16.07.2020ರಂದು ಮಂಡಿಸತಕ್ಕದ್ದು.

ARE-1

KARNATAKA LOKAYUKTA

19)

No:Compt/LOK/BD-1346/2019

Date: 04-02-2021

ORDER

This is a suo-motu proceeding initiated by means of my order dated 11-01-2019 and 26-04-2019 in Compt/Lok/BCD-2349/2018 with regard to the bad/dilapidated conditions of the Government school buildings in Chikkaballapur District. There are similar suo-motu proceedings initiated by me in respect of other districts of the state.

2. Pursuant to the direction issued by me, the Deputy Director of Public Instructions, Chikkaballapur District has submitted a status report dated19-07-2019 setting out the details of the schools situated in Chikkaballapur District which requires urgent major and minor repairs. It is useful to extract the relevant portion of the report which reads as hereunder:-



क्रिक्टिस स्टूड न्या के किन्द्र निवास के कि

6	. 0	I	2 0	۱ س		ы		1	Τ.	.T	St (or		
-		-1	- 1		2 Hg		-	H	-		2, Car		
Armed a Park	MACO	DODODOUGE	DOSSA:795	populacipa	poplacipp	poplacing			7		33. 33.		
Samo			a	_	17000000000000000000000000000000000000	elozooni elozooni			ů.		हत. इ.स. १५ १५		
6		Par, act	STEEL VICEOUS	Citables	Ti-Date tilled	thosuson			4		원 (원 (명)		
94	124	88	203	707	707	101			5		ಶಾಲೆಗಳ ಪ್ರಸಂ		
220	391	256	400	1/0	770	334		334	6		्र व ० व स क		
3121	5627	4196	OCCK	770 13451	10454	4664		4664	7		ವಿದ್ಯಾರ್ಥಿಗ ಳ ಸಂಖ್ಯೆ		
330	472	310	158	983	000	419		419	00	ಶಿಕ್ಷಕರ ವಿದ್ಯಾರ್ಥಿಗ ಇರುವ ಸಂಖ್ಯೆ ಈ ಸಂಖ್ಯೆ ಕೊತಡಿಗಳ ಸಂಖ್ಯೆ			
									9		ರೈಸ್ ಕೋಡ್		
14	37	38	7	109		Y.		35	10	લ દુવ	ಪೆಲಸಮಗೆ ಬೋಧನೆ ಎಳಿಸಿ ಎಂಬ ಹೆಚ್ಚುವರಿ ನಿರ್ಮಾಣ ಕೊಠಡಿ ಬೇಡಿಕೆ ಬೇಡಿಕೆ		
6	26	16	55	198		<i>u</i>		31	11	ಭೌತಿಕ	ಗೋಧನೆಗ ಾಗಿ ಹೆಚ್ಚುವರಿ ಕೊಠಡಿ ಬೇಡಿಕೆ		
18	137	68	154	219	100	103		103	12	ಭೌತಿಕ	g.		
18.4	109.6	282.25	192.65	276.7	212.3	2775		27250000	13	[ರ್ಲಿಕ್ಗಳಲ್ಲಿ] ಕನಿರ್ಣ	ದುರಸ್ತಿ ಬೇಡಿಕೆ		
œ	66	49	ω	91	-	u		3	14	Eg Ga	ಹೆಚ್ಚುವರಿ ಶೌಚಾಲಯ ವೃವಸ್ಥೆ ಬೇಡಿಕೆ		
00	59	28		57	-	-		1	15	El Sa	ಹೆಚ್ಚುವರಿ ಕುಡಿಯುವ ಬೀರಿನ ವೈವಸ್ಥೆ ಬೇಡಿಕೆ		
9	44.4	51		44	3-				16	ಭೌತಿಕ	e E		
15.5	434.06	734		79.5	-			100000	17	[ರೂ.ಆಗ್ಗಳಲ್ಲಿ]	ಆಟದ ಮೈದಾನ ಬೇಡಿಕೆ		
1865	59.55	3895	100	7945	330	750		350	18	ಭೌತಿಕ [ಮೀಟರ್ಗಳ	ಕಾಂಪೌಂಡ್ ಬೇಡಿಕೆ		
4150	0	530	2000	1540					19	P. C.	र्ठव्य		
	0	2.9	10	63.86					20	ಭೌತಿಕ ಆರ್ಥಿಕ [ಮೀಟರ್ಗಳ ಭೌತಿಕ [ರೂ.ಲಕ್ಷಗಳಲ್ಲಿ ಲ್ಲಿ]	ಗ್ರಂಥಾಲಯ ಬೇಡಿಕೆ		
2	20	0		10020					21	ಭ್ರತ್ನಿ	নী ত্ৰ গ্ৰ		
ω	1000000	0		139					22		ಇತರೆ ಸೌಲಭ್ಯಗಳು ಬೇಡಿಕೆ		
42.65	553,606		202.67	573.16	2/3.5			27350524	23	[ದಾ.ಲಕ್ಷಗಳಲ್ಲಿ] [ದಾ.ಲಕ್ಷಗಳಲ್ಲಿ] ಆರ್ಥಿಕ	ಒಟ್ಟು ಮೊತ		

Đ.

- 3. After examining the report submitted by the respondent No.3, exercising the powers conferred on me under Section 12(1) of Karnataka Lokayukta Act, I had made an order dated 07-12-2019 directing the respondents to examine the report of respondent No.3 and take steps to carry out repairs to the school buildings located at Chikkaballapur District. It is relevant to extract paragraph No.4 to 6 of my order dated 07-12-2019, which reads as hereunder:-
 - "4) In the light of what is stated above, it is the duty of the officer incharge of educational institutions both Government and private to monitor regularly the conditions of the building with regard to the suitability of the building and take immediate measures to carry out the repairs etc., if it is the Government educational institution and if it is private/aided education institution to give appropriate directions to the concerned who are running/managing such educational institutions to take immediate appropriate remedial steps to make the building suitable for use and to avoid any untoward incident to the students and staff of the school. Failure to take remedial measures in my considered has to be considered as administration on the part of the authorities of the State within the meaning of Section 2(10) of the Karnataka Lokayukta Act. The list enclosed would disclose that several buildings, as referred in the list, are in a very bad condition and is likely to cause serious injury to the life and liberty of the students



and to the teachers who are attending the school and therefore they call for immediate repair and remedial measures.

- Hence, I am of the view, it would be in the interest of justice to make an order in exercise of the powers conferred on me under Section 12(1) of the Karnataka Lokayukta Act, to direct the respondents to examine the list submitted by Deputy the Director (Administration), Public Instructions Department, Chikkaballapur District and take steps to carry out repairs to the school buildings located at Chikkaballapur District, without further delay and at any event not later than six months from the date of receipt of this order.
- 6) Further, the respondents are directed to file the interim Status Report with regard to the steps taken by the authorities to carry out the direction given above within three months from the date of receipt of this order".
- 4. Pursuant to my order dated 07-12-2019, Respondent No.1 Principal Secretary to Government, Primary and Secondary Education Department, Bengaluru has submitted a status report dated 09-11-2020. It is useful to extract the said report, which reads as hereunder:

"ವಿಷಯ: ಚಿಕ್ಕಬಳ್ಳಾಪುರ ಜಿಲ್ಲೆಯಲ್ಲಿರುವ ಶಿಥಿಲ ಶಾಲಾ ಕಟ್ಟಡಗಳ ದುರಸ್ಥಿ ಬಗ್ಗೆ ಕಚೇರಿಯಲ್ಲಿ ದಾಖಲಾಗಿರುವ ಸ್ವಯಂಪ್ರೇರಿತ ದೂರಿನ ಕುರಿತು.

ಉಲ್ಲೇಖ : ತಮ್ಮ ಕಚೇರಿಯ ಪತ್ರ ಸಂಖ್ಯೆ:ಕಂ.ಲೋಕ್/ಬಿಡಿ/1364/2019, ದಿನಾಂಕ:13.12.2019. ಮೇಲ್ಕಂಡ ವಿಷಯ ಮತ್ತು ಉಲ್ಲೇಖಿತ ಪತ್ರಕ್ಕೆ ಸಂಬಂಧಿಸಿದಂತೆ, ಕಳೆದ o3 ವರ್ಷಗಳಲ್ಲಿ ಚೆಕ್ಕಬಳ್ಳಾಪುರ ಶೈಕ್ಷಣಿಕ ಜಿಲ್ಲೆಯಲ್ಲಿ ಬರುವ ಶಾಲೆಗಳ ದುರಸ್ಥಿ ಹಾಗೂ ನಿರ್ಮಾಣ ಕಾಮಗಾರಿಗಳಿಗಾಗಿ ಬಿಡುಗಡೆಯಾದ ಅನುದಾನದ ಮಾಹಿತಿಯನ್ನು ಅನುಬಂಧ-1ರಲ್ಲಿ ಲಗತ್ತಿಸಿದೆ.

ಸದರಿ ಜಿಲ್ಲೆಗೆ ಕಳೆದ 03 ವರ್ಷಗಳಲ್ಲಿ ಒಟ್ಟಾರೆಯಾಗಿ ರೂ.2092.76 ಲಕ್ಷಗಳನ್ನು ಒದಗಿಸಲಾಗಿರುತ್ತದೆ. ಮುಂದುವರೆದು, 2020-21ನೇ ಸಾಲಿಗೆ ಸಾರ್ವಜನಿಕ ಶಿಕ್ಷಣ ಇಲಾಖೆಯ ರಾಜ್ಯವಲಯದ ಮುಂದುವರೆದ ಯೋಜನೆ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ರಮದಡಿಯಲ್ಲಿ ರೂ.29.21 ಕೋಟಿಗಳ ಅನುದಾನದಲ್ಲಿ ಮಹಾತ್ಮಗಾಂಧಿ ನರೇಗಾ ಯೋಜನೆಯಡಿಯಲ್ಲಿ ಸಾರ್ವಜನಿಕ ಶಿಕ್ಷಣ ಇಲಾಖೆಯ ಅನುದಾನವನ್ನು ಒಗ್ಗೂಡಿಸುವಿಕೆಯ (Convergence) ಮುಖಾಂತರ ಸರ್ಕಾರಿ ಪ್ರಾಥಮಿಕ ಮತ್ತು ಪ್ರೌಢ ಶಾಲೆಗಳಿಗೆ ಮೂಲಭೂತ ಸೌಕರ್ಯಗಳಾದ ಶಾಲಾ ಶೌಚಾಲಯ ನಿರ್ಮಾಣ, ಆಟದ ಮೈದಾನ, ಶಾಲಾ ಕಾಂಪೌಂಡ್ ನಿರ್ಮಾಣ ಮುಂತಾದ ಅಭಿವೃದ್ಧಿ ಚಟುವಟಿಕೆಗಳ ಕಾಮಗಾರಿಗಳನ್ನು ಕೈಗೊಳ್ಳಲು ಸರ್ಕಾರದ ಆದೇಶ ಸಂಖ್ಯೆ:ಇಪಿ 150 ಯೋಸಕ 2020, ಬೆಂಗಳೂರು ದಿನಾಂಕ:12.08.2020ರ ಮೂಲಕ ಆದೇಶ ಹೊರಡಿಸಲಾಗಿರುತ್ತದೆ.

ಪ್ರಾಥಮಿಕ ಮತ್ತು ಪ್ರೌಢ ಶಿಕ್ಷಣ ಇಲಾಖೆಗೆ ಸರ್ಕಾರಿ ಶಾಲೆಗಳ ಮೂಲಭೂತ ಸೌಕರ್ಯಗಳಿಗೆ ಪ್ರತಿ ವರ್ಷ ಆಯವ್ಯಯದಲ್ಲಿ ಒದಗಿಸಲಾದ ಅನುದಾನದ ಲಭ್ಯತೆಗೆ ಅನುಗುಣವಾಗಿ ಆದ್ಯತೆ ಮೇರೆಗೆ ಸರ್ಕಾರಿ ಶಾಲೆಗಳಿಗೆ ಮೂಲಭೂತ ಸೌಕರ್ಯಗಳನ್ನು ಒದಗಿಸಲಾಗುತ್ತಿದೆ.

ಮುಂದುವರೆದು, ಪ್ರಸ್ತುತ ಸಾಲಿನಲ್ಲಿ ಕೋವಿಡ್-19 ವಿಷಮ ಪರಿಸ್ಥಿತಿಯಿದ್ದು ಆರ್ಥಿಕ ನಿರ್ಬಂಧನೆ ಇರುವುದರಿಂದ, ಇಲಾಖೆಗೆ ನೀಡಲಾಗಿದ್ದ ಅನುದಾನವು ಸಹ ಕಡಿತಗೊಂಡಿರುತ್ತದೆ. ಈ ಹಿನ್ನೆಲೆಯಲ್ಲಿ ಮುಂದಿನ ದಿನಗಳಲ್ಲಿ ಅನುದಾನದ ಲಭ್ಯತೆಗೆ ಅನುಗುಣವಾಗಿ ಹಂತಹಂತವಾಗಿ ಶಾಲಾ ಕಟ್ಟಡಗಳ ದುರಸ್ಥಿ ಮತ್ತು ಮರುನಿರ್ಮಾಣ ಕಾರ್ಯವನ್ನು ಆದ್ಯತೆ ಮೇರೆಗೆ ಕೈಗೊಳ್ಳಲಾಗುವುದು ಎಂಬ ಅಂಶವನ್ನು ಮಾನ್ಯ ಲೋಕಾಯುಕ್ತರ ಅವಗಾಹನೆಗೆ ತಂದು ಪ್ರಕರಣವನ್ನು ಕೈಬಿಡಲು ಆದೇಶ ಪಡೆಯಲು ಕೋರುತ್ತೇನೆ.

ಚಿಕ್ಕಬಳ್ಳಾಪುರ ಜಿಲ್ಲೆ

ಕಳೆದ 03 ವರ್ಷಗಳಲ್ಲಿ ಚಿಕ್ಕಬಳ್ಳಾಪುರ ಶೈಕ್ಷಣಿಕ ಜಿಲ್ಲೆಯಡಿಯಲ್ಲಿ ಬರುವ ಶಾಲೆಗಳ ದುರಸ್ಥಿ ಹಾಗೂ ನಿರ್ಮಾಣ ಕಾಮಗಾರಿಗಳಿಗಾಗಿ ಈ ಕೆಳಕಂಡಂತೆ ಅನುದಾನ ಮಂಜೂರು ಮಾಡಲಾಗಿರುತ್ತದೆ. 1. ರಾಜ್ಯ ಬಂಡವಾಳ ವೆಚ್ಚದಡಿ ದುರಸ್ಥಿ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಕಾಗಿ ಈ ಕೆಳಕಂಡಂತೆ ಅನುದಾನ ಬಿಡುಗಡೆ ಮಾಡಲಾಗಿರುತ್ತದೆ.

ರೂ.ಲಕ್ಷಗಳಲ್ಲಿ

ರೂ.ಲಕ್ಷಗಳಲ್ಲಿ

	ಪ್ರಾ	ಥಮಿಕ ಶಾಲೆ	' ಗಳು	ಪ್ರೌಢ ಶಾಲೆಗಳು			
ವರ್ಷ	ಶಾಲೆಗಳ	ಕೊಠಡಿಗಳ	ಬಿಡುಗಡೆಯಾದ	ಶಾಲೆಗಳ	ಕೊಠಡಿಗಳ	ಬಿಡುಗಡೆಯಾದ	
	ಸಂಖ್ಯೆ	ಸಂಖ್ಯೆ	ಅನುದಾನ	ಸಂಖ್ಯೆ	ಸಂಖ್ಯೆ	ಅನುದಾನ	
2017– 18	66	76	84.26	36	125	78.50	
2018- 19	57	62	63.19	38	71	63.69	
2019– 20	18	79	42.18	12	46	36.29	
ఒట్కు	141	217	189.63	86	242	178.48	

2. ರಾಜ್ಯ ಬಂಡವಾಳ ವೆಚ್ಚದಡಿ ನಿರ್ಮಾಣ ಕಾಮಗಾರಿಗಳಿಗಾಗಿ ಈ ಕೆಳಕಂಡಂತೆ ಅನುದಾನ ಬಿಡುಗಡೆ ಮಾಡಲಾಗಿರುತ್ತದೆ.

ರೂ.ಲಕ್ಷಗಳಲ್ಲಿ

ರೂ.ಲಕ್ಷಗಳಲ್ಲಿ

ವರ್ಷ	G	್ರಾಥಮಿಕ ಶ	<u>ಲೆಗಳು</u>	ಪ್ರೌಢಶಾಲೆಗಳು			
	ಶಾಲೆಗಳ	ಕೊಠಡಿಗಳ	ಬಿಡುಗಡೆಯಾದ	ಶಾಲೆಗಳ	ಕೊಠಡಿಗಳ	ಬಿಡುಗಡೆಯಾದ	
	ಸಂಖ್ಯೆ	ಸಂಖ್ಯೆ	ಅನುದಾನ	ಸಂಖ್ಯೆ	ಸಂಖ್ಯೆ	ಅನುದಾನ	
2017– 18	9	9	78.30	12	12	159.00	
2018– 19	37	49	519.40	15	27	425.25	
2019– 20	5	7	74.20	6	6	94.50	
ಒಟ್ಟು	51	65	671.90	33	45	678.75	

2019-20ನೇ ಸಾಲಿನಲ್ಲಿ ಮಳೆ ಹಾನಿಯಿಂದ ಹಾನಿಗೊಳಗಾದ ಸರ್ಕಾರಿ ಶಾಲಾ ಕೊಠಡಿಗಳ ಮರು ನಿರ್ಮಾಣಕ್ಕಾಗಿ ಆರ್.ಐ.ಡಿ.ಎಫ್-25 ಯೋಜನೆಯಡಿ ಮಂಜೂರಾದ ಅನುದಾನದ ವಿವರ ಈ ಕೆಳಕಂಡಂತಿದೆ.

RIDF-25:

ರೂ.ಲಕ್ಷಗಳಲ್ಲಿ

ರೂ.ಲಕ್ಷಗಳಲ್ಲಿ

			- i			ω "
ವರ್ಷ	ō	ಪ್ರಾಥಮಿಕ ಶ	ಾಲೆಗಳು	ಪ್ರೌಢಶಾಲೆಗಳು		
	ಶಾಲೆಗಳ	ಕೊಠಡಿಗಳ	ಬಿಡುಗಡೆಯಾದ	ಶಾಲೆಗಳ	ಕೊಠಡಿಗಳ	ಬಿಡುಗಡೆಯಾದ
	ಸಂಖ್ಯೆ	ಸಂಖ್ಯೆ	ಅನುದಾನ	ಸಂಖ್ಯೆ	ಸಂಖ್ಯೆ	ಅನುದಾನ
2019-	32	34	374.00	-		

ಸದರಿ ಜಿಲ್ಲೆಗೆ ಕಳೆದ 03 ವರ್ಷಗಳಲ್ಲಿ ಒಟ್ಟಾರೆಯಾಗಿ ರೂ. 2092.76 ಲಕ್ಷಗಳನ್ನು ಒದಗಿಸಲಾಗಿರುತ್ತದೆ. ಮುಂದುವರೆದು, 2020-21ನೇ ಸಾಲಿಗೆ ಸಾರ್ವಜನಿಕ ಶಿಕ್ಷಣ ಇಲಾಖೆಯ ರಾಜ್ಯವಲಯದ ಮುಂದುವರೆದ ಯೋಜನೆ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ರಮದಡಿಯಲ್ಲಿ ರೂ.29.21 ಕೋಟೆಗಳ ಅನುದಾನದಲ್ಲಿ ಮಹಾತ್ಮಗಾಂಧಿ ನರೇಗಾ ಯೋಜನೆಯಡಿಯಲ್ಲಿ ಸಾರ್ವಜನಿಕ ಶಿಕ್ಷಣ ಇಲಾಖೆಯ ಅನುದಾನವನ್ನು ಒಗ್ಗೂಡಿಸುವಿಕೆಯ(Convergence) ಮುಖಾಂತರ ಸರ್ಕಾರಿ ಪ್ರಾಥಮಿಕ ಮತ್ತು ಪ್ರೌಢ ಶಾಲೆಗಳಿಗೆ ಮೂಲಭೂತ ಸೌಕರ್ಯಗಳಾದ ಶಾಲಾ ಶೌಚಾಲಯ ನಿರ್ಮಾಣ, ಆಟದ ಮೈದಾನ, ಶಾಲಾ ಕಾಂಪೌಂಡ್ ನಿರ್ಮಾಣ ಮುಂತಾದ ಅಭಿವೃದ್ಧಿ ಚಟುವಟಿಕೆಗಳ ಕಾಮಗಾರಿಗಳನ್ನು ಕೈಗೊಳ್ಳಲು ಸರ್ಕಾರದ ಆದೇಶ ಸಂಖ್ಯೆ:ಇಪಿ 150 ಯೋಸಕ 2020, ಬೆಂಗಳೂರು ದಿನಾಂಕ:12.08.2020ರ ಮೂಲಕ ಆದೇಶ ಹೊರಡಿಸಲಾಗಿರುತ್ತದೆ".

5. The report extracted above indicates that for the last three years the government has made available in the budget Rs.2092.76 lakhs for the purpose of repair and construction of school buildings in Chikkaballapur District and during 2020-21 a sum Rs.29.21 Crores has been made available under NAREGA scheme for providing basic infrastructure/amenities to the schools in Chikkaballapur District like toilets, playgrounds, construction of compound walls etc. Further the report indicates that the repair works of the pending

school buildings could not be taken up for want of funds/budget.

- 6. The object of this proceeding is to improve the infrastructure facilities required to be provided for Primary & Higher primary Schools throughout the state. It is needless to point out that, it is an obligation, duty and responsibility of the state to provide a quality education and buildings which are safe and does not expose the students for threat of physical injury and threat to life. No doubt, for all this the state requires financial resources. The report of respondent No.1 also indicates that for want of required budget they could not take up the essential repair works of the school buildings.
- 7. In this connection it is also useful to refer to the observations made by the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India, in the case of **Ashoka Kumar** Thakur v. Union of India, (2008) 6 SCC 1 which reads as hereunder:-

369. Free and compulsory education is now a fundamental right under Article 21-A. The

State is duty-bound to implement this article on a priority basis. There has been grave laxity in its implementation. This laxity adversely affects almost every walk of life. In my opinion, nothing is more important for the Union of India than to implement this critical article.

420. Under Article 21A, it is a mandatory obligation of the State to provide free and compulsory education to all children aged six to fourteen. In order to achieve this constitutional mandate, the State has to place much greater emphasis on allocating more funds for primary and secondary education. There is no corresponding constitutional right to higher education. The entire Nation's progress virtually depends upon the proper and effective implementation of Article 21A.

431. Undoubtedly, the Government has allocated more funds of late for education, but we need to have far more allocation of funds and much greater emphasis on free and compulsory education. Anything less would flout Article 21A's mandate.......

432. In a country where only 18% of those in the relevant age group make it to higher education, this is incredible. See NSSO 1999-2000. It is not suggested that higher education needs to be neglected or that higher education should not receive more funds, but there has to be much greater emphasis on the primary education. Our priorities have to be changed. Nothing is really more important than to ensure total compliance with Article 21A. How can a sizeable portion of the population be precluded from realizing the benefits of development when almost everyone acknowledges that the children are our future?

434. Mr. P.P. Rao, learned Senior Advocate, rightly submitted that when you lack a school

W//

building, teachers, books and proper facilities, your schooling might be "free" but it is not an "education" in any proper sense. Adequate number of schools must be established with proper infrastructure without further delay. In order to achieve the constitutional goal of free and compulsory education, we have to appreciate the reality on the ground. A sizeable section of the country is still so poor that many parents are compelled to send their children to work. The State must carve out innovative policies to ensure that parents send their children to school.

- 435. In addition to free education and/or other financial assistance, they should also be given books, uniforms and any other necessary benefits so that the object of Article 21A is achieved. Time and again, this Court, in a number of judgments, has observed that the State cannot avoid its constitutional obligation on the ground of financial inabilities.
- 8. The Hon'ble Supreme Court in Ashok Kumar Thakur's case referred to above has observed the state cannot avoid its constitutional obligation on the financial inabilities. Therefore, ground of education provided by the government institutions cannot be of inferior quality either in the matter of academic curriculum or in the matter of providing necessary infrastructure. Without eradicating educational backwardness it is not conducive to promote fraternity among all citizen assuring the

dignity of the individual and the unity and integrity of the nation which is an important Constitutional goal. I am sure the concerned who are required to provide funds to improve the quality of education by providing highly qualified teachers/staff and other infrastructure will be able to appreciate what is stated above which considering the report given by Respondent-3 in this matter as well as in all the connected matters and take very objective decision to provide necessary funds.

9. Further, it is well known that, only the children of poorer and weaker section of the society are going to the government institutions. Therefore, the state is required to take all necessary steps for improving the school buildings and discharge it constitutional obligations. If the children who are the future of this country are allowed to study in the schools which are in a dilapidated condition and unsafe/unsound buildings, it is not only dangerous to the life and limb of the child and also it affect the quality

education that would be imparted in such kind of schools.

10. In this connection it is useful to refer to the observations made by the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India, in the case of **Avinash Mehrotra Vs. Union of India and others** reported in (2009) 6 SCC 398 which reads as hereunder:

"24. Education occupies an important place in our Constitution and culture. There has been emphasis on free and compulsory education for children in this country for a long time. There is a very strong historical perspective. The Hunter Commission in 1882-1883, almost 125 years ago, recommended universal education in India. It proposed to make education compulsory for the children.

25. The Government of India Act, 1935 provided that "education should be made free and compulsory for both boys and girls". While debating on a Bill in the Imperial Legislation Council in 1911, Shri Gopal Krishna Gokhale strongly advocated that elementary education should be both compulsory and free.

26. Our original Framers of the Constitution placed free and compulsory education in the directive principles. The unamended Article 45 provided that:

"45. Provision for free and compulsory education for children.—The State shall endeavour to provide, within a period of ten years from the commencement of this Constitution, for free and compulsory education for all children until they complete the age of fourteen years."

27. The Kothari Commission on Education set up by the Government of India in 1966 strongly recommended free and compulsory education for children up to 14 years. The Commission observed that there is no other way for the poor to climb their way out of this predicament.

28. Education occupies a sacred place within our Constitution and culture. Article 21-A of the Constitution, adopted in 2002, codified this Court's holding in *Unni Krishnan*, *J.P.* v. *State of A.P.* [(1993) 1 SCC 645] in which we established a right to education. Parliament did not merely affirm that right; the amending Act placed the right to education within the Constitution's set of fundamental rights, the most cherished principles of our society. As the Court observed in *Unni Krishnan*¹: (SCC p. 664, para 8)

"8. The immortal poet Valluvar whose *Tirukkural* will surpass all ages and transcend all religions said of education:

'Learning is excellence of wealth that none destroy; To man nought else affords reality of joy.'"

- 29. Education today remains liberation—a tool for the betterment of our civil institutions, the protection of our civil liberties, and the path to an informed and questioning citizenry. Then as now, we recognise education's "transcendental importance" in the lives of individuals and in the very survival of our Constitution and Republic.
- 30. In the years since the inclusion of Article 21-A, we have clarified that the right to education attaches to the individual as an inalienable human right. We have traced the broad scope of this right in R.D. Upadhyay v. State of A.P. [(2007) 15 SCC 337: AIR 2006 SC 1946] holding that the State must provide education to all children in all places, even in prisons, to the children of prisoners. We have also affirmed the inviolability of the right to education.
- 35. The Constitution likewise provides meaning to the word "education" beyond its dictionary meaning. Parents should not be compelled to send their children to dangerous schools, nor should children suffer compulsory education in unsound buildings.
- 36. Likewise, the State's reciprocal duty to parents begins with the provision of a free education, and it extends to the State's regulatory power. No matter where a family seeks to educate its children, the

State must ensure that children suffer no harm in exercising their fundamental right and civic duty. States thus bear the additional burden of regulation, ensuring that schools provide safe facilities as part of a compulsory education.

- 37. In the instant case, we have no need to sketch all the contours of the Constitution's guarantees, so we do not. We merely hold that the right to education incorporates the provision of safe schools.
- 39. In view of the importance of Article 21-A, it is imperative that the education which is provided to children in the primary schools should be in the environment of safety.
- 45. In the end, we should need to do little but enforce existing laws and encourage States in their own well-intentioned safety programmes. However, in the years since the fire at Lord Krishna Middle School, some States have moved slowly and safety standards have varied in quality across the States. These delays and variations have subjected millions more school children to danger from fire, earthquakes and other causes, when simple enhancements could offer much greater protection. Articles 21 and 21-A of the Constitution require that India's school children receive education in safe schools. In order to give effect to the provisions of the Constitution, we must ensure that India's schools adhere to basic safety standards without further delay.
- 46. It is the fundamental right of each and every child to receive education free from fear of security and safety. The children cannot be compelled to receive education from an unsound and unsafe building.
- 47. In view of what happened in Lord Krishna Middle School in District Kumbakonam where 93 children were burnt alive and several similar incidences had happened in the past, therefore, it has become imperative to direct that safety measures as prescribed by the National Building Code of India, 2005 be implemented by all government and private schools functioning in our country. We direct that:

- (i) Before granting recognition or affiliation, the State Governments and Union Territories concerned are directed to ensure that the buildings are safe and secure from every angle and they are constructed according to the safety norms incorporated in the National Building Code of India.
- (ii) All existing government and private schools shall install fire extinguishing equipments within a period of six months.
- (iii) The school buildings be kept free from inflammable and toxic material. If storage is inevitable, they should be stored safely.
- (iv) Evaluation of structural aspect of the school may be carried out periodically. We direct that the engineers and officials concerned must strictly follow the National Building Code. The safety certificate be issued only after proper inspection. Dereliction in duty must attract immediate disciplinary action against the officials concerned.
- (v) Necessary training be imparted to the staff and other officials of the school to use the fire extinguishing equipments."
- 11. Based on the materials collected during the course of the investigation of this proceeding, I am satisfied that the children who are studying in the schools which are in a dilapidated condition are facing injustice and undue hardship on account of the failure of the state to get the school buildings repaired periodically. Thereby, there is violation of fundamental right to education guaranteed under Article 21A of the Constitution of India and also seriously affects the right to life and liberty

guaranteed to the students under Article 21 of the Constitution of India. It is needless to point out that one of the functions of the Lokayukta is to redress the grievance of the public who have sustained injustice or undue hardship in consequence of maladministration.

In the light of what is stated above, I am sure 12. the concerned authorities of the state who are in-charge of managing the affairs of the state would take in to account the need of providing necessary funds for the purpose of repairs, construction of school buildings, class rooms, compound, toilets etc., and also appointing necessary staff to the school. Hoping that the concerned authorities of the state would consider the entire matter objectively and keeping in mind constitutional obligations and goals, necessary funds would be provided, at this stage I do not find it necessary for me to examine the power conferred on me u/Sec. 12(1) of the Karnataka Lokayukta Act to make an appropriate order to redress the grievances of the students who attend

the Government Primary and Higher Primary Schools in the state. I have also no doubt when the request made by the department of Primary and Higher Education is fair and reasonable. authorities/Finance Department would consider the same objectively as the goal of both the departments are to work for the benefit/welfare of the people and it is in consonance with the object of Part-IV of the Constitution of India.

13. Communicate this order to the respondents, the Additional Chief Secretary to Government, Finance Department and to the Secretary to the Government, Finance Department (Budget and Resources).

List this matter as well as all the connected matters on 04-03-2021 for further orders.

bokayukta, State of Karnataka

26) 4-3.2021

ಸಕಾಪಡಿ ಪ್ರಿಪ್ ನ ವಿರ್ಯಾಪಕ್ ಶಿಕ್ಷ್ಮಿನ್ ಇಂಗಾತಿಕಪರಿಂದ ಪೆಠಣ ಬಂದರುತ್ತದೆ. ಅವರ ಮುಖ್ಯ ವಿರ್ಯಪರ್ನ ಸರ್ಧಿಕ ಇಂಗಾರೆ, ಮತ್ತು ಶಿರ್ಯಪರ್ಕ್ (ಒಹ್ಮ ಕ ಶಾಗುತಿ (ಬಕ್ಷಿಸ್) ಕಪರಾದ ಪೆಠಣ ಬಂದರುವುದಲ್ಲ .

Issue reminder to R-2, R-3 and also to the Additional Chief Secretary to the Government, Finance Department and also to the Secretary to the Government, Finance Department to submit report by 04/05/2021.

ARE-1